

Federal Court



Cour fédérale

<p><b>Ottawa, January 28, 2020</b> – A Judgment was issued today by the Honourable Justice Michael L. Phelan of the Federal Court in files T-2153-00 and T-2155-00:</p>	<p>Oyasiwêwin kî-pakitinikâtêw anohc ohci Honourable Justice Michael L. Phelan Okimânâhk Wiyasiwêwinohk ohci pîhci masinahikanikh T-2153-00 êkwa T-2155-00:</p>
<p><b>IN THE MATTER OF PETER WATSON et al v HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN et al; and WESLEY BEAR et al v HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN et al</b></p>	<p><b>PISISKÉYIHCİKÉWIN OHCI PETER WATSON</b> êkwa kotakak mawinêham <b>KIHCI-OKIMÂSKWÊW</b> êkwa kotakak; êkwa <b>WESLEY BEAR</b> êkwa kotakak mawinêham <b>KIHCI-OKIMÂSKWÊW</b> êkwa kotakak</p>
<p><b><u>Court Decision</u></b></p> <p>The Federal Court determined that the amalgamation of two Treaty 4 Indian Bands, the Chacachas and Kakisiwew into the Ochapowace Indian Band, was unlawful by virtue of the failure of the federal Crown to implement the promises of Treaty 4 in accordance with its obligation of “honour of the Crown”.</p>	<p><b><u>Wiyasiwêwinohk Oyasiwêwin</u></b></p> <p>Okimânâhk Wiyasiwêwin kîsasiwâtam êkwanima mâmawipicikêwin ohci ôhi nîso Ostêsimâ woyasiwêwin néwo Nêhiyaw Iskonikana, ôma Chacachas êkwa Kakisiwew pîhci-Ochapowace Nêhiyaw Iskonikan, kî-mâyahkamikan kwayaskwâtiwiwin ohci êwako ôma kapatâpahcikatêk ohci okimânâhk Kihci-Owiyasiwêw ta-pihkohtât asotamakêwina ohci Ostêsimâwoyasiwêwin néwo pîhci isi têpakêyimowin asici onâkatêyihtamowin ohci “kistêyihtâkosiwin ohci Kihci-Owiyasiwêw”.</p>
<p>This finding was the first part of long-standing litigation to re-establish the Bands as separate entities. The second part of the litigation will deal with further issues of the consequences of this declaration and the appropriate remedies to be fashioned. The Court maintains jurisdiction over this case and has given the parties 90 days to outline their proposals for this next phase.</p>	<p>Miskâkêw êwako ôma nistam êsa kinwêspimohtêmakan paminikêwin kâwi tasipwêpayihcikatêw ôhi Iskonikana êkwanahihi pâhpahkân ihtâwina. Kîhtwâm pahki ôma paminikêwin ta-atoskâcikatêw awasimê pisiskêyihtamowina ohcipayiwin ohci ôma wîhtamâkêwin êkwa katawâhk mînohtâwin tasâpohtêmakan. Wiyasiwêwinohk kanawêyihtam ôma paminikêwin pâscí ôma wiyasiwêwin êkwa mîkiw isi mawinêhikewak kîkâmitâtahomitawanaw kîsikaw ta-kiskinwahikêcik owiyasiwâtamowin kiki kîhtwâm yahkohtêwin.</p>
<p><b><u>Summary</u></b></p> <p>Justice Phelan found that the promises in Treaty 4</p>	<p><b><u>Kiskinwahikêwin</u></b></p> <p>Justice Phelan miskam mîna asotamakêwina pîhci</p>

<p>included a promise of a reserve for each band. The Bands claimed that lands surveyed in 1876 became reserves lands for each Band separately. In 1881 Canada surveyed a joint reserve for the Kakisiwew and Chacachas and in 1884 the two bands were combined without consent into one band when Chief Ochapowace became chief of the amalgamated band: the Ochapowace Band.</p>	<p>Ostēsimâwoyasiwêwin nêwo kikinikâtêw asotamakêwin ohci askîhkân kiki tahto iskonikan. Iskonikana wîhtamwak êkwanihi askiya ka-kî-wâpahcikatêkihk ispîhk 1876 ki-kwêskastâwak isi askîhkân askiya kiki tahto Iskonikan pâh-pahkân. Ispîhk 1881 Kânata kí-wâpahtam mâmawipicikêwin kiki Kaki-siwew êkwa Chacachas êkwa mina ispîhk 1884 nîso ôhi Iskonikana kî-mâmawinikatêwa ata namôya ê-kî-pakitêyihcikatêk isi pêyak iskonikan ispîhk Okimâhkân Ochapowace kî-okimâhkâniwiw ohci mâmawi picikêwin iskonikan: êwako ôma Ochapowace Iskonikan.</p>
<p>The descendants of the two original Bands, particularly the Chacachas, claimed that the amalgamation was accomplished without their required consent. The Bands have also claimed for declaration as to their status and for compensation for breaches of fiduciary duties, breaches of trust, and breaches of treaty.</p>	<p>Wâhkômakanak ohci ôhi nîso nistam Iskonikana, wâwîs ôma Chacachas, wihtamwak êkwania mâmawipicikêwin kî-kîshtâwak ata namôya wiyawaw kî-ohci pakitêyimwak. Iskonikana mîna natotamwak kêhcinâhiwêwin kiki akihtâsowin êkwa mîna tipahikêwin kiki kwêskiwêpinikêwin ohci sôniyâwi-nâkatêyihtamowin, kwêskiwêpinikêwin ohci mamiši-totâ-kêwin, êkwa kwêskiwêpinikêwin ohci ostêsimâwoyasiwêwin.</p>
<p>Canada has denied the Bands' claims, factually and legally, including that the reserves were never created and that amalgamation was done with consent. Canada further said that even if the claims are proven, the claims are time-barred or otherwise acquiesced in by the members of the Bands at the time of amalgamation and for years subsequent to the amalgamation.</p>	<p>Kânata ânwêyihtam ôhi Iskonikan ô-natotamakêwina, tipiyaw êkwa mîna kwayaskitastêwin, asici mîna askîhkân namoya kî-osihcikatêw êkwa mina mâmawipicikêwin kitôcikâtêw asici pakitêyimowin. Kânata ayiwak itwêw kispin ohi natotamakêwina kêhcinâc, natotamakêwina osam-kinwêseskamik aspin ahpô kîspin piko kî-têpêyimowak ôki pimohtêstamakêwak ohci Iskonikan ispîhk aspin mâmawipicikêwin êkwa tântahto askiy aspin ôma mâmawipicikêwin.</p>
<p>The first phase of the trial engaged, in part, in answering specific questions set by Justice Hugessen in 2008 principally related to the existence of the Bands, the amalgamation and the recognition of those Bands in current circumstances. The Court concluded that, in addition to the unlawful amalgamation, the Chacachas Band has continued as a distinct rights bearing collective even if not recognized as a band under the <i>Indian Act</i>, and it is entitled to</p>	<p>Nistam yahkohtêwin ohci mâmawapiwin mâmawohkamwak, pahki, ê-mâmiskôcikâtêk mêmohci kakwêcihkêmowin itastêw ohci Justice Hugessen ispîhk 2008 osâm piko êwako ohci ihtawin ôhi Iskonikana, ôma mâmawipicikêwin êkwa nisitawêyihtâkosiwin ohci êkoni Iskonikana mêmôc ôma ka-itahkamikahk. Wiyasiwêwinohk kêshtaw asici êkwania, asici mina mâyahkamiskiwin ohci mâmawipicikêwin, ôma Chacachas Iskonikan ki-âhkamêyihtam tâpiskôc miyikowisin isi tipêyihcikêwin ata namôya ê-</p>

assert treaty rights under Treaty 4.	nisitawêyihtâkwahk isi iskonikan sîpâ ôma <i>Nêhiyaw Pimohtêstamakêwin</i> , êkwa mîna kaskihtamâsow ta-âhkamêyihtahk ostêsimâwoyasiwêwin miyikowisin sîpâ Ostêsimâwoyasiwêwin nêwo.
The Court held that declarations regarding the constitutionality of Crown conduct are not time-barred, but that the Chacachas and Kakisiwew Bands are estopped from seeking further treaty land entitlements from Canada because of settlement agreements made.	Wiyasiwêwinohk kîsasi-wâtam êkwanihi wîhtamâkêwina ohci ispîhtêyihtâkosiwin ôma tipêyihcikêwin isi Kihci-Owiyasiwêw opaminikêwin êkwanihi namôya osamkinwêskamik, mâka ekwanihi Chacachas ekwa Kakisiwew Iskonikan kipihtinawak tannatonahkihk awasimê ostêsimâwoyasiwêwin askiy tipêyihcikêwin ohci Kânata ayis ohci nahêyihtowin tipêyimowin ka-osihcikatêkihk.
Justice Phelan reiterated that the purpose of this declaration is to provide a basis for the descendants of the two Bands, the existing Ochapowace Band and Canada to negotiate or otherwise determine how the Chacachas people can separate from the Ochapowace Band.	Justice Phelan kîhtwâm itwêw êwako oma wîhtamâkêwin itâpatan ta-pakitinahk nîkânîhtâwin kiki ôki wâhkômâkanak ohci ôhi nîso Iskonikana, ôhi ka-ihtakokihk Ochapowace Iskonikan êkwa Kânata ta-âyimôcikatêk aphô tâtêpêyimocik tanisi isi ôki Chacachas ayisiniwak ta-kî-pâh-pahkâniwin ayâcik ohci Ochapowace Iskonikan.
The issues of how that separation will be accomplished as well as a number of other complex issues will be the subject of the second phase of this litigation.	Ôhi pisiskêyihtamowina tanisi isi êkwanima pâhpahkâniwin ta-kî-kîsihcikâtêk êkwa mîna itahto kotaka nanâtohk pisiskêyihtamowina êkwanihi nâkatohkêwina kîhtwam yahkohtêwin ohci ôma paminikêwin.

\*\*

An audio recording of this summary in the Cree language will be available as soon as possible on the Court website at: <https://www.fct-cf.gc.ca/en/pages/media/webcast>

A copy of the decision can be obtained via the Web site of the Federal Court: <https://decisions.fct-cf.gc.ca/fc-cf/decisions/en/item/460388/index.do>